

Memorandum

United States Department of Education
Institute of Education Sciences
National Center for Education Statistics

DATE: March 3, 2015
TO: Shelly Martinez, OMB
FROM: Sharon Boivin, NCES
THROUGH: Kashka Kubzdela, NCES
SUBJECT: Employment and Earnings Survey – Second Round of Cognitive Testing (OMB# 1850-0803 v.130)

Submittal-Related Information

The following material is being submitted under the National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) clearance agreement (OMB #1850-0803) which allows NCES to improve the methodologies, question types, and/or delivery methods of its survey and assessment instruments by conducting field tests, pilot tests, focus groups, and cognitive interviews. This request is to conduct a second round of cognitive interviews to aid in development of employment and earnings items for the National Household Education Survey (NHES) program. These items will also inform the U.S. Department of Education's development of a new gainful employment survey that will be used by postsecondary programs to survey graduates about their earnings. The first round of cognitive interviews for this development effort and recruitment for the second round were approved separately in January 2015 (#1850-0803 v.123 and v.125, respectively). The data collection for this study is being carried out for NCES by RTI International (contract # ED-IES-13-C-0070).

As background, the NHES collects earnings information as part of the Adult Training and Education Survey. This survey is designed to collect nationally-representative data on the attainment of non-degree credentials and the labor market characteristics of individuals with such credentials. As part of its submission for OMB clearance for the full scale 2016 NHES, NCES will propose a small pilot test to compare collecting point estimates versus categories for respondent earnings. If it is feasible to collect point estimates, NCES can derive variables reflecting poverty status to include on public use files, providing licensed analysts will have more sensitivity for modeling the relationship between credential attainment and labor market outcomes. The cognitive interviews described in this submittal will test the proposed survey item language. For ease of reference, the items proposed here for testing are referred to as the Employment and Earnings Survey.

The proposed cognitive interviews will also inform the gainful employment survey, which will be used by institutions to appeal program-level debt-to-earnings ratios calculated by the U.S. Department of Education (ED) under the gainful employment regulations (34 CFR Parts 600 and 668). The earnings component of the debt-to-earnings ratio (D/E ratio) is provided by the Social Security Administration, but institutions may calculate an alternative earnings measure by administering a survey to program graduates. Under the regulations, NCES is responsible for developing the survey and the technical standards to which programs must adhere in its administration. Institutions that choose to submit alternate earnings appeal

information will survey all students from programs who graduated during the same period that ED used to calculate the D/E ratios, or a comparable period as defined in 668.406(b)(3) of the regulations. The survey will provide an additional source of earnings data for ED to consider before deciding on final D/E ratios for programs subject to the gainful employment regulations. Programs with final D/E ratios that fail to meet the minimum threshold may face sanctions, including the possible loss of Title IV (federal financial aid) program funds.

Two rounds of cognitive interviews will refine the Employment and Earnings Survey questions in order to maximize the quality of data collected and provide information on issues with important implications for the survey design. The initial survey and plans for its testing were developed with input from a Technical Review Panel (TRP) that met on December 2, 2014 (membership of the panel is provided in Attachment I). The results of the first round of testing, which was conducted in January and February 2015, were shared with a panel convened by the National Institute of Statistical Sciences (NISS) on February 27, 2015 (membership of the NISS panel is included in Attachment II, and a copy of the report from the first round of testing is included as Attachment VI). The most significant recommendation from the first round of testing was to combine all income questions into a single multi-part question in order to help respondents correctly distinguish sources of income without double counting. Neither the time burden imposed by the survey nor the sensitivity of the items was reported as a concern by participants. The most significant recommendation from the NISS panel was to revamp the questions to help respondents understand the need to report income from ALL sources and to help them recall their earnings information from two years prior to data collection. To improve recall, the revised survey asks respondents to focus first on the job they held the longest, and then on all other jobs. This approach, recommended by panel member Katharine Abraham and agreed to by the other panel members, is designed to help respondents think about their actual employment situation in 2013. The goal is to elicit total earnings, not to count earnings for the longest job separately.

This request is to conduct the second round of cognitive testing of the Employment and Earnings Survey. In addition to the aforementioned Attachments I, II, and IV, this submission includes the informed consent form for cognitive interview participants (Attachment III), the questionnaire to be tested in the cognitive interviews (Attachment V), and the protocol for conducting the cognitive interviews (Attachment VI).

Design and Context

Like the first round, the second round of cognitive testing of the Employment and Earnings Survey will be conducted for NCES by its contractor, RTI International (RTI), in three of RTI's U.S. office locations – Research Triangle Park, NC; Washington, DC; and Chicago, IL. Participants will be recent graduates (up to 4 years following completion of the credential) from institutions in the vicinity of RTI's offices, including online program graduates residing in the same geographic areas. RTI will recruit sufficient numbers of graduates to ensure 15 completed interviews. The recruitment material and the screener for participants were already approved on January 30, 2015 (#1850-0803 v.125).

The desired sample will include a mix of respondents who are (1) recipients of a degree or certificate from any level of private for-profit institutions and (2) recipients of a certificate, associates degree, or other vocational credential at public and private not-for-profit 2-year and less-than-2-year institutions. To help inform gainful employment regulations, the sample will overrepresent graduates from private for-profit less-than-2-year and 2-year institutions. Such schools had higher than average metric failure rates. Table 1 provides a distribution of the desired minimum number of interview participants by control and level of institution.

Table 1: Desired minimum number of respondents, by institution control and level

Institution control	Institution level	Credential type(s)	Minimum number of respondents
Private for-profit	Less-than-2-year	Vocational certificates	4
	2-year	Vocational certificates and associates	4
	4-year	All	2
Private not-for-profit	Less-than-2-year and 2-year	Vocational certificates and associates	2
Public	Less-than-2-year and 2-year	Vocational certificates and associates	3

As in the first round, cognitive testing will involve one-on-one interviews in which the respondent is asked to “think aloud” as he or she answers survey questions and to answer additional questions about the items they just answered. The survey is being developed and tested as a paper-and-pencil instrument. Each testing session will last about 40 minutes. In order to encourage participation in this study, potential respondents will be offered a \$40 incentive for their participation. Arrangements will be made to allow NCES staff to observe the testing and a recording of each interview will be available to NCES for review.

Assurance of Confidentiality

Cognitive interview participants will be informed that their participation is voluntary and that their responses may be used only to help inform the survey design and may not be disclosed, or used, in identifiable form for any other purpose except as required by law (Education Sciences Reform Act of 2002, 20 U.S.C. § 9573). Participants will be assigned a unique student identifier (ID) that will be created solely for file management and used to keep all materials together. The participant ID will not be linked to the student’s name in any way. Participants will sign an informed consent form (Attachment III) which will be kept separate from the interview files and notes in a locked cabinet in a secure room for the duration of the study and destroyed after the final report is submitted.

Schedule for Development of the Employment and Earnings Survey

This second round of interviews is scheduled to take place in mid March 2015. The final draft of the survey will be used in a pilot test with approximately 3,400 program graduates beginning in April 2015. All survey item development activities need to be completed by the end of June 2015 for inclusion in the clearance request for the 2016 collection of NHES and to inform the gainful employment regulations that will be posted in the Federal Register by July 1,

2015. The request for the pilot test will be submitted to OMB as soon as all required materials become available.

Estimate of Respondent Burden

To yield 15 completed interviews, we anticipate screening up to 60 individuals for eligibility to achieve the desired distribution of program graduates. The recruitment and screening process, which has been approved and underway, was estimated to take on average 5 minutes per person.

Table 2: Estimate respondent burden for recruitment for second round of cognitive interviews

Activity	Number of respondents	Number of responses	Minutes per respondent	Maximum total burden hours
Screening*	60	60	5	5
Cognitive interview	15	15	40	10
Study Total	15	15		10

*Burden for screening was approved in January 2015, and thus is not counted in the total burden requested in this submission.

Cost to Federal Government

The cost to the federal government for developing and cognitive and pilot testing the survey will be \$555,570, which includes contractor staff time, incentives, and project materials.

Attachment I
Employment and Earnings Survey (EES) Technical Review Panel Members

Geri Anderson
Special Assistant to the President for External
Affairs
Aims Community College
5401 West 20th Street
Greeley, CO 80632
Phone: (303)503-4074
Email: geri.anderson@aims.edu

Angela Bell
Senior Executive Director of Research and
Policy Analysis
University System of Georgia
270 Washington Street SW
Atlanta, GA 30334
Phone: (404)962-3069
Email: angela.bell@usg.edu

Jennifer Blum
Senior Vice Present, External Relations &
Public Policy
Laureate Education, Incorporated
1500 K Street NW, Suite 250
Washington, DC 20005
Phone: (202)393-1303
Email: jennifer.blum@laureate.net

Kathy Booth
Senior Research Associate
WestEd
300 Lakeside Drive, 25th Floor
Oakland, CA 94612
Phone: (510)302-4208
Email: kbooth@wested.org

Patrick Crane
Project Manager
West Virginia Community & Technical College
System
1018 Kanawha Boulevard East, Suite 700
Charleston, WV 25301
Phone: (304)558-0087
Email: crane@wvctcs.org

Mark DeFusco
Senior Research Associate
University of Southern California
Rossier School of Education
Waite Phillips Hall WPH 701B
Los Angeles, CA 90089-4037
Phone: (213)740-7218
Email: mbd_001@usc.edu

Christine Fuglestad
Director of Government Affairs
Capella University
225 South 6th Street, 9th Floor
5019 Wentworth Avenue
Minneapolis, MN 55419
Phone: (612)977-4524
Email: christine.fuglestad@capella.edu

Alfred Gottschalck
Chief, Labor Force Statistics Branch
US Census Bureau
4600 Silver Hill Road
Washington, DC 20233
Phone: (301)763-5883
Email: alfred.o.gottschalck@census.gov

KC Greaney
Director, Office of Institutional Research
Santa Rosa Junior College
680 Sonoma Mountain Parkway
Richard Call Bldg., Annex
Petaluma, CA 94954
Phone: (707)778-4188
Email: kgreaney@santarosa.edu

Stephen Haworth
Senior Manager, Reporting & Policy Research
Devry Education Group
3005 Highland Parkway
Downers Grove, IL 60515
Phone: (630)353-1434
Email: shaworth@devrygroup.com

G. Scott Jenkins
Vice Provost for Academic Affairs and
Undergraduate Programs
North Carolina A&T State University
1601 East Market Street
Dowdy Building 318
Greensboro, NC 27411
Phone: (336)285-3039
Email: gsjenkin@ncat.edu

Anthony Jones
Graduate Faculty
Appalachian State University
151 College Street, Suite 217-B
Boone, NC 28608
Phone: (828)262-2287
Email: jonesap1@appstate.edu

John Kolotos
Policy Analyst
U.S. Department of Education
1990 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20202
Phone: (202)502-7762
Email: john.kolotos@ed.gov

Tod Massa
Director, Policy Research and Data
Warehousing
State Council of Higher Education for Virginia
101 North 14th Street
Richmond, VA 23219
Phone: (804)225-3147
Email: todmassa@schev.edu

Heather McKay
Director, Education and Employment Research
Center
Rutgers University
94 Rockafeller Road
Piscataway, NJ 08854-8054
Phone: (848)445-4735
Email: hmckay@rci.rutgers.edu

Charles Nelson
Assistant Division Chief, Economic
Characteristics
Census Bureau
4600 Silver Hill Road
Washington, DC 20233
Phone: (301)763-3183
Email: charles.t.nelson@census.gov

Kent Phillipe (unable to attend)
Associate Vice President, Research & Student
Success
American Association of Community Colleges
One Dupont Circle NW
Suite 410
Washington, DC 20036
Phone: (202)416-4505
Email: kphillippe@aacc.nche.edu

Anne Polivka
Supervisory Research Economist, Employment
Research Chief
Bureau of Labor Statistics
2 Massachusetts Avenue NE, Suite 4945
Washington, DC 20212
Phone: (202)691-7395
Email: polivka.anne@bls.gov

Casey Sacks
Manager
Colorado Community College System
9101 East Lowry Boulevard
Denver, CO 80230
Phone: (720)858-2841
Email: casey.sacks@cccs.edu

Rajat Shah
Senior Vice President, Student Financial
Services
Lincoln Technical Institute
200 Executive Drive, Suite 340
West Orange, NJ 7052
Phone: (973)766-9099
Email: rshah@lincolnedu.com

Christine Tracy
Director of Research
Association for Private Sector Colleges and
Universities
1100 Connecticut Avenue NW
Suite 900
Washington, DC 20036
Phone: (202)336-6804
Email: chris.tracy@apscu.org

Christina Whitfield
Vice Chancellor
Kentucky Community & Technical College
System
300 North Main Street
Versailles, KY 40383
Phone: (859)256-3184
Email: christina.whitfield@kctcs.edu

Paul Umbach
Professor, Higher Education and Educational
Evaluation and Policy Analysis
Department of Leadership, Policy, and Adult
and Higher Education
North Carolina State University
300 Poe Hall, Box 7801
Raleigh, NC 27695
Phone: (919)515-9366
Email: paul_umbach@ncsu.edu

National Center for Education Statistics

Sharon Boivin
Mathematical Statistician
U.S. Department of Education, NCES
1990 K Street NW, Room 9052
Washington, DC 20006
Phone: (202)502-7627
Email: sharon.boivin@ed.gov

Chris Chapman
Acting Associate Commissioner, Sample
Surveys
U.S. Department of Education, NCES
1990 K Street NW, Room 9042
Washington, DC 20006
Phone: (202)502-7414
Email: chris.chapman@ed.gov

Tracy Hunt-White
Education Statistician
U.S. Department of Education, NCES
1990 K Street NW, Room 9018
Washington, DC 20006
Phone: (202)502-7438
Email: tracy.hunt-white@ed.gov

Marilyn Seastrom
Chief Statistician
U.S. Department of Education, NCES
1990 K Street NW, Room 9040
Washington, DC 20006
Phone: (202)502-7303
Email: marilyn.seastrom@ed.gov

Sean Simone
Statistician
U.S. Department of Education, NCES
1990 K Street NW, Room 8125
Washington, DC 20006
Phone: (202)502-7367
Email: sean.simone@ed.gov

RTI International

Jeff Franklin
Senior Survey Methodologist
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Phone: (919)485-2614
Email: jwf@rti.org

Alan Karr
Director, Center of Excellence for Complex
Data Analysis
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Phone: (919)316-3423
Email: karr@rti.org

T. Austin Lacy
Education Research Analyst
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Phone: (919)990-8386
Email: tlacy@rti.org

John Riccobono
Vice President, Education & Workforce
Development
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Phone: (919)541-7006
Email: jar@rti.org

Peter Siegel
Senior Statistician
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Phone: (919)541-6348
Email: siegel@rti.org

Erin Velez
Education Research Analyst
RTI International
701 13th Street NW
Suite 750
Washington, DC 20005
Phone: (202)974-7879
Email: evelez@rti.org

Jennifer Wine
Senior Director, Program in Education Survey
Design
RTI International

3040 East Cornwallis Road
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Phone: (919)541-6870
Email: jennifer@rti.org

Attachment II
NCES/NISS Gainful Employment Survey Content Panel Members (February 27, 2015 - Washington, DC)

Katherine Abraham
Professor of Economics and Survey
Methodology
University of Maryland
1218 LeFrak Hall
College Park, MD 20742
Email: kabraham@umd.edu

Margaret Ayanian
Business Operations
U.S. Department of Education
Federal Student Aid (FSA)
830 First Street NE
Washington, DC 20202
Email: Margaret.Ayanian@ed.gov

Sharon Boivin
Chair, Interagency Working Group
on Expanded Measures of
Enrollment and Attainment
National Center for Education
Statistics
1990 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006
Email: Sharon.Boivin@ed.gov

Chris Chapman
Associate Commissioner
National Center for Education
Statistics
1990 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006
Email: Chris.Chapman@ed.gov

Erin Dunlop Velez
Research Education Analyst
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road,
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Email: evalez@rti.org

Michael Larsen
Associate Professor
George Washington University
Rome Hall
801 22nd Street NW
Washington, DC 20052
Email: mlarsen@bsc.gwu.edu

Brent Madoo
Assistant Director
U.S. Department of Education
Federal Student Aid (FSA)
830 F Street NW
Suite 413
Washington, DC 20202
Email: Brent.Madoo@ed.gov

Isaiah O'Rear
Associate Research Scientist
National Center for Education
Statistics
1990 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006
Email: Isaiah.Orear@ed.gov

Emilda Rivers
Program Director, Human Resources
Statistics
National Center for Science and
Engineering Statistics
National Science Foundation
4201 Wilson Boulevard
Arlington, VA 22230
Email: erivers@nsf.gov

Marilyn Seastrom
Chief Statistician
National Center for Education
Statistics
1990 K Street NW
Washington DC, 20006
Email: Marilyn.Seastrom@ed.gov

Nell Sedransk
Acting Director
National Institute of Statistical
Sciences
19 T.W. Alexander Drive,
P.O. Box 14006
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Email: sedransk@niss.org

Joy Edington
ESSIN Research Analyst/Statistician
National Institute of Statistical
Sciences
1776 Eye Street NW
Washington DC, 20006
Email: jedington@niss.org

Martin Frankel
Professor of Statistics
The City University of New York
Baruch College
One Bernard Baruch Way
(55 Lexington Avenue, at 24th Street)
New York, NY 10010
Email: martin.frankel@baruch.cuny.edu

Tina Temples
U.S. Department of Education
Federal Student Aid (FSA)
80 F Street NW
Washington, DC 20202
Email: Tina.Temples@ed.gov

Alan Karr
Director, Center of Excellence for
Complex Data Analysis
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road,
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Email: karr@rti.org

Saki Kinney
Research Statistician
National Institute of Statistical
Sciences
19 T.W. Alexander Drive,
P.O. Box 14006
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Email: saki@niss.org

Tushar Sheth
Special Assistant, Planning,
Evaluation, and Policy Development
U.S. Department of Education
400 Maryland Avenue SW
Washington, DC 20202
Email: Tushar.Sheth@ed.gov

Peter Siegel
Statistician
RTI International
3040 East Cornwallis Road,
P.O. Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
Email: siegel@rti.org

Sean Simone
Statistician
National Center for Education
Statistics
1990 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006
Email: Sean.Simone@ed.gov

Clyde Tucker
Principal Researcher, Education
Program American Institutes for
Research
1000 Thomas Jefferson Street NW
Washington, DC 20007
Email: nctucker@cox.net

Andrew White
Senior Research Statistician,
Statistical Standards and Data Confidentiality

National Center for Education Statistics
1990 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006
Email: Andrew.White@ed.gov

Attachment III Participant Informed Consent



Consent to Participate in Research

Title of Research: Employment and Earnings Survey – Cognitive Interview

Introduction

You are being asked to participate in a cognitive interview to help improve a new survey being developed. The survey items will be used by the U.S. Department of Education as part of the National Household Education Study in 2016 and by institutions of higher education to appeal program-level debt-to-earnings rates as calculated by the Department. Before you decide if you want to take part in this study, please read this Informed Consent form so that you understand what the interview is about and what you will be asked to do. This form also tells you who can participate in the interviews, the risks and benefits of participating, how we will protect your information, and who you can call if you have questions. Please ask the researcher to explain anything you don't understand before you make your decision.

Purpose

The interview is being conducted on behalf of the National Center for Education Statistics, within the U.S. Department of Education, by RTI International, a research organization with headquarters in Research Triangle Park, North Carolina.

Participation will involve answering questions and reviewing a survey for an upcoming study. During the interview, we will ask you to complete a survey questionnaire on paper or on a computer and give us your thoughts on the questions you are being asked. In addition, we will ask you questions as you go in order to measure your understanding and interpretation of the questions in the survey. The information from the interviews will help us finalize development of the questions for the national survey instrument.

Procedures

You are one of 15 individuals participating in these cognitive interviews. The interview will be audio recorded to make sure we don't miss anything that you say and to help us write a report summarizing the results of the interviews. Upon completion of the written report, the recording will be destroyed. Your name or any information that could identify you personally will not be used in the report that we write.

Study Duration

Your participation in the cognitive interview will take about 40 minutes.

Possible Risks or Discomfort

We do not anticipate that any of the discussion topics will make you uncomfortable or upset. However you may refuse to answer any question or take a break at any time.

Your Benefits

There are no direct benefits to you from participating in this study.

Benefits for Other People

We hope that these interviews will help us produce quality questions for the national survey being developed with the U.S. Department of Education.

Token of Appreciation for Participation

You will receive \$40 upon completion of the interview.

Confidentiality

RTI International is conducting this study for the National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) of the U.S. Department of Education. This study is authorized by law under the Education Sciences Reform Act (20 U.S.C., Section 9543). Your participation is voluntary. Your responses may only be used for statistical purposes and may not be disclosed, or used, in identifiable form for any other purpose except as required by law (20 U.S. Code, Section 9573).

Future Contacts

We will not contact you in the future.

Your Rights

Your decision to take part in this research study is completely voluntary. You can refuse to answer any question and you can stop participating at any time.

Your Questions

If you have any questions about the study, you may call Dr. Jennifer Wine at RTI International (919-541-6870). If you have any questions about your rights as a study participant, you may call RTI's Office of Research Protection at 1-866-214-2043 (a toll-free number).

YOU WILL BE GIVEN A COPY OF THIS CONSENT FORM TO KEEP.

Your signature below indicates that you have read the information provided above, have received answers to your questions, and have freely decided to participate in this research. By agreeing to participate in this research, you are not giving up any of your legal rights.

Signature of Participant

Date

Printed Name of Participant

I certify that the nature and purpose, the potential benefits, and possible risks associated with participating in this research have been explained to the above-named individual.

Signature of Person Obtaining Consent

Date

Printed Name of Person Obtaining Consent