

Memorandum

Date: July 14, 2017

To: Stephanie Tatham, OMB Desk Officer, Food and Nutrition Service

Through: Christina Sandberg, Food and Nutrition Service, Information Collection Clearance Officer, Planning & Regulatory Affairs; Ruth Brown, United States Department of Agriculture, Office of Chief Information Office, Department Clearance Officer

C.S.

From: Alicia White, Branch Chief, Nutrition Education and Promotion Branch, NPTAD, Child Nutrition Programs
USDA – Food and Nutrition Service

Re: Under Approved Generic OMB Clearance No. 0584-0524 Request for Approval to Perform Formative Research to develop Educational Materials for Parents, Caregivers, and Child Care Providers of Children Ages 2-5

The Food and Nutrition Service (FNS) of the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) is requesting approval for formative research under Approved Generic OMB Clearance No. 0584-0524 Generic Clearance to Conduct Formative Research.

This request is to acquire clearance to conduct formative research with parents, caregivers, and child care providers from sites that participate in the USDA Food and Nutrition Service's Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP). This research will inform the revision of the *Nibbles for Health Nutrition Newsletters* and *Nutrition and Wellness Tips for Young Children: Provider Handbook for the Child and Adult Care Food Program* to reflect recent CACFP Meal Pattern revisions, recent guidance from the 2015-2020 Dietary Guidelines for Americans, and other updates. The research will identify parents', caregivers', and child care providers' perceptions and preferences in order to inform the development of materials. The following information is provided for your review:

1. **Title of the Project:** Formative Research to Develop Educational Materials for Parents, Caregivers, and Child Care Providers of Children Ages 2-5
2. **Control Number:** 0584-0524, Expires 09-30-2019
3. **Public Affected by this Project:**
Individuals/Households
 - Parents and Caregivers of Children Ages 2-5

State and Local/Tribal Employees

- Child care providers, teachers, and food planning/preparation staff who serve child care sites in low-income areas
- Directors or other administrators of child care sites in low-income areas

- Staff at State Agencies that administer CACFP

See section 7, *Project Purpose, Methodology & Formative Research Design*, for a description of the number of participants for each audience (parents/caregivers and child care providers) by research methodology (triad focus groups and in-depth interviews, respectively).

4. Number of Respondents:

Table 4.1 – Screeners*

Audience	# of Participants
State Agency Staff (Initial Discussion)	3
Child Care Providers: Directors (Initial CACFP Site Recruitment)	18
Parents/Caregivers (Triad participant)	75
Child Care Providers: Teachers and Food Planning/Preparation Staff (Interview participant)	15
Child Care Providers: Directors (Interview participant)	9
Total	120

*Includes non-responders, those not applicable (e.g., CACFP sites with low numbers of children ages 2-5 in their care) and those choosing not to participate. The number of unique respondents for this collection is 111. For the Child Care Providers: Directors (Interview Participants), the number of directors who are actually interviewed are part of the 18 directors who are participating in the initial CACFP site recruitment.

Table 4.2 – Consent Forms*

Audience	# of Participants
Child Care Providers: Directors (CACFP Site Consent)	12
Parents/Caregivers (Triad participant)	60
Child Care Providers: Teachers and Food Planning/Preparation Staff (Interview participant)	12
Child Care Providers: Directors (Interview participant)	6
Total	90

*The audience for the consent forms are all counted as part of the unique respondents for each group: 75 for the parent/caregivers; 15 for the teachers and food planning/preparation staff; and 18 for the directors.

Table 4.3 – Research Activities by Audience*

Target Audience	Research Activity	# of Participants
State Agency Staff	Identify Potential Sites	3
Child Care Providers: Directors	Assisting Recruitment	9
	Coordinating Schedules	9
Parents/Caregivers	Triad**	60
Child Care Providers: Teachers and	Interview	9

Food Planning/Preparation Staff		
Child Care Providers: Directors	Interview	3
Total		93

*The research activities are all counted as part of the unique respondents for each group: 75 for the parent/caregivers; 15 for the teachers and food planning/preparation staff; 18 for the directors; and 3 for the state agency staff.

**Triads will recruit 5 to seat 3-5

5. Time Needed Per Response:

Table 5.1 - Time Needed per Screener and Recruitment Activities

Target Audience	Time (minutes)	Time (hours)
State Agency Staff (Initial Discussion)	30	0.5
Child Care Providers: Directors (Initial CACFP Site Recruitment)	90	1.5
Parents/Caregivers (Triad participant)	5	0.08
Child Care Providers: Teachers and Food Planning/Preparation Staff (Interview participant)	5	0.08
Child Care Providers: Directors (Interview participant)	5	0.08

Table 5.2 - Time Needed per Consent Form

Target Audience	Time (minutes)	Time (hours)
Child Care Providers: Directors (CACFP Site Participation)	12	0.20
Parents/Caregivers (Triad participant)	5	0.08
Child Care Providers: Teachers and Food Planning/Preparation Staff (Interview participant)	5	0.08
Child Care Providers: Directors (Interview participant)	5	0.08

Table 5.3 - Time Needed for Research Activities by Audience

Target Audience	Research Activity	Time (minutes)	Time (hours)
State Agency Staff	Identify Potential Sites	60	1
Child Care Providers: Directors	Assisting Recruitment	15	0.25
	Coordinating Schedules	15	0.25
Parents/Caregivers	Triad	90	1.5
Child Care Providers: Teachers and Food Planning/Preparation Staff	Interview	60	1

Child Care Providers: Directors	Interview	60	1
------------------------------------	-----------	----	---

6. Total Burden Hours on Public: 154.56 hours.

Affected Public		(a) ID	(b) Screeners, Surveys	(c) No. Respon- dents	(d) Frequency of Response	(e) Est. Total Annual Responses per Respondent (c x d)	(f) Hours per Response	(g) Total Burden Hours (e x f)
Parents and Caregivers		A, B	Screeners	75 [^]	1	75	0.08	6
		G, H	Consent Forms	60	1	60	0.08	4.8
		L, M, P, Q	Triad	60	1	60	1.5	90
Subtotal of Unique Public				75		195		100.8
Child Care Providers	Teachers and Food Planning/ Preparation Staff	C, D	Screeners	15 [^]	1	15	0.08	1.2
		I, J	Consent Forms	12	1	12	0.08	0.96
		N, O, P, Q, R, S, T, Y	Interview	9	1	9	1	9
	Directors	U, V	CACFP Site Recruitment****	18 [^]	1	18	1.5	27
		K, W	CACFP Site Consent Forms*	12	1	12	0.2	2.4
		E, F	Assist Triad Recruitment**	9	1	9	0.25	2.25
			Assist IDI Recruitment***	9	1	9	0.25	2.25
		C, D	Screeners	9	1	9	0.08	0.72
		I, J	Consent Forms	6	1	6	0.08	0.48
		N, O, P, Q, R, S, T, Y	Interview	3	1	3	1	3

Subtotal of Unique Public			33		102		49.26
State Agency Staff		Initial Discussion	3 [^]	1	3	0.5	1.5
		Identify Potential Sites	3	1	3	1	3
Subtotal of Unique Public			3		6		4.5
Total			111	-	303	-	154.56

[^]Unique respondents affected by this data collection.

*The estimated time includes 2 minutes to read the email (Attachment W) and 10 minutes to complete the consent form (Attachment K).

**Display and distribute flyers to parents/caregivers.

***Identify staff and provide consent forms.

****The estimated time covers both the 60 minutes for the screener for the CACFP sites (Attachment U) and 30 minutes for the CACFP site screener follow-up (Attachment V).

7. Project Purpose, Methodology, and Formative Research Design:

Background

The USDA Food and Nutrition Service (FNS) administers the nutrition assistance programs for the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA). The mission of FNS is to provide children and low resource families better access to food and a more healthful diet through its nutrition assistance programs. Among these programs are the Child Nutrition Programs, including the National School Lunch Program (NSLP), School Breakfast Program (SBP), Summer Food Service Program (SFSP), and the Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP). The Child Nutrition Programs provide nutritionally balanced, low-cost, or free meals and snacks to its participants.

As authorized under Section 6(a)(3) of the Richard B. Russell National School Lunch Act, 42 USC 1755(a)(3), FNS provides training and technical assistance for school foodservice, nutrition education for children and their caregivers, and encourages school and community support for healthy eating and physical activity. These activities are implemented under the Agency's Team Nutrition initiative that is designed to improve children's lifelong eating and physical activity habits by using the principles of the *Dietary Guidelines for Americans*.

The Healthy, Hunger-Free Kids Act of 2010 (HHFKA) required sweeping changes to the FNS Child Nutrition Programs, including CACFP. The act mandated updates to the requirement of meals and snacks served in CACFP in order to reflect the science behind the nutritional needs of CACFP's diverse participants. As a result, the CACFP Meal Pattern was revised, and a Final Rule was released in April 2016. Additionally, HHFKA expanded the purpose of CACFP to promote health and wellness in child care settings and mandated the FNS to provide training and

technical assistance to help child care centers and family or group child care homes comply with current guidelines and recommendations.

Under the Team Nutrition initiative, FNS is currently developing materials to 1) assist CACFP providers in successfully implementing the CACFP Meal Pattern Final Rule; 2) to reflect the most recent guidance from the 2015-2020 Dietary Guidelines for Americans; 3) provide revised versions of both materials in Spanish and English; and 4) to engage today's parents/caregivers and child care providers, using nutrition messages that are practical, relatable, and motivational.

Purpose

The purpose of the proposed research is to obtain feedback from the target audiences about the content and format of two existing resources. One resource will be reviewed by small group discussions with three participants (triads) and both resources will be reviewed by in-depth interview (IDI) participants.

1. The *Nibbles for Health* newsletter series is being updated to assist providers in sharing messages about healthy behaviors with parents and caregivers of children ages 2-5 in their charge (see Attachments P and Q). Sample illustrations for use in the newsletters will also be reviewed (see Attachment Y).
 - a. Research for the *Nibbles for Health* newsletters among providers is intended to gauge how likely providers are to distribute the newsletters to parents/caregivers of children in their care, how well they like the design and format of the newsletters, and the degree to which they agree with the newsletter content.
 - b. Research for the *Nibbles for Health* newsletters among parents and caregivers is designed with the intent of assessing how well parents and caregivers understand the information as intended, are motivated to act upon the information presented, find the newsletter design/graphics eye-catching and appealing, and find the content useful and easy-to-read.
2. *Nutrition and Wellness Tips for Young Children: Provider Handbook for the Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP)* is a training tool for CACFP providers and other staff that includes recommendations, guidelines, and best practices that are consistent with USDA and U.S. Department of Health and Human Services recommendations and requirements for nutrition, active play, screen time, and wellness for children less than 5 years of age (see Attachments R and S). Sample illustrations for use in the tips will also be reviewed (see Attachment T).
 - a. Research for the *Provider Handbook* targets CACFP providers only. The intent of this research will assess whether the target audience understands the information as intended, is motivated to act upon the information, finds the suggestions to be realistic, doable, and effective, finds the design and newly developed illustrations eye-catching and appealing, and finds the content useful and easy-to-read.

Specifically, the objective is to ensure that both resources are understood as intended, culturally appropriate, easy-to-read, motivational, and practical for low-income parents and the child care settings that serve them.

Methodology/Research Design

This research will utilize both IDI and triads research methodologies. Triads will be conducted with parents and caregivers. IDIs will be conducted with child care providers, including teachers, meal planners/preparers, and directors, at CACFP sites. Triads and IDIs will be conducted in both English and Spanish. Nine CACFP Sites, 3 sites in 3 geographic markets, will be selected for hosting the study. To be eligible, sites must participate in CACFP. Table 4.1 highlights the total number of participants – of all target audiences – that will be recruited for the research approach.

In-Depth Interviews

IDIs will be conducted with child care providers, specifically directors, child care providers/teachers of children ages 2-5 years old, and staff involved in meal planning or food preparation at CACFP sites. A total of twelve (12) 60-minute IDIs will be conducted. IDIs will be conducted in three geographic markets: Bronx, NY, Miami-Dade County, FL, and Gwinnett County, GA. Four interviews will be conducted in each location. A minimum of one interview will be with a provider at a Family Child Care Home and a Child Care Center in each geographic market. Eighteen child care providers will be invited to assure 12 interviews are conducted.

Participants will meet the following criteria:

- All participants must be the director of a CACFP site that serves children ages 2-5, provide care to children ages 2-5 from low-income families at a CACFP site, **or** be involved in meal planning or food preparation at a CACFP site;
- At least one participant in each geographic market will be a Spanish-speaker;
- Participants will represent a mix of children ages 2-5 in their care;
- At least one participant in each geographic market will be male¹;
- Participants will not include individuals who have participated in a research study in the past 6 months **or** participated in a study that was related to childcare, nutrition, or healthcare in the past year; and
- Participants will not include individuals, or individuals with anyone in their household or immediate family, who work in nutrition, public health, or dietetics.

The IDIs will be facilitated in English and Spanish by trained researchers using a discussion guide (see Attachments N and O) and used to gather feedback from CACFP providers on the usability, content, and design of the materials. To avoid undue burden, all IDIs will be conducted at the CACFP site where they work and scheduled at times that are convenient for participating staff.

¹ FNS is requesting there be at least one male to have participants that reflect a variety of diverse views. Research shows that gender may impact attitudes and beliefs towards nutrition, nutrition education, and meal preparation. Some of the children in CACFP have males as their sole provider. Their input is valuable to developing successful newsletters for the target audience.

Triads

Triads will be conducted with parents and caregivers of children ages 2-5 years enrolled in CACFP sites. A total of twelve (12) 90-minute triads of 3 participants will be conducted. Triads will be conducted in three geographic markets: Bronx, NY, Miami-Dade County, FL, and Gwinnett County, GA. Four triads will be conducted in each geographic market. Half of the triads in each geographic market will be conducted in English and the other half will be conducted in Spanish. At least one triad in each geographic market will be at a Family Child Care Home. Five parents/caregivers will be invited to assure 3-5 participants are seated for each triad. Table 7.1 below outlines the segmentation of participants by location and CACFP site type.

Table 7.1 – Segmentation of Triads by location and language

Geographic Market	English Language (# Triads)	Spanish Language (# Triads)
Bronx, NY	2	2
Miami-Dade County, FL	2	2
Gwinnett County, GA	2	2
Total Triads	6	6

Participants in triads will meet the following criteria:

- All participants must be a parent or caregiver of a child ages 2-5 years;
- At least one participant in each geographic market will be the parent/caregiver of a 2-year old;
- At least one participant in each geographic market will be the parent/caregiver of a 3-4-year old;
- At least one participant in each geographic market will be male;
- At least one participant in each geographic market will be age 56 or older²;
- Participants will not include individuals who have participated in a research study in the past 6 months or participated in a study related to childcare, nutrition, or healthcare in the past year; and
- Participants will not include individuals, or individuals with anyone in their household or immediate family, who work in nutrition, public health, or dietetics.

Triads with caregivers and parents will be conducted at child care sites. To the extent possible, triads will be held at the same child care site that cares for the children of participating parents and caregivers. In the event that parents and caregivers are recruited from multiple centers/homes to reach N=3, triads will be conducted at the CACFP sites that are most convenient for participants to minimize travel expenses. To avoid additional burden on staff

² FNS is requesting there be at least one male and one participant age 56 or older to have participants that reflect a variety of diverse views. Research shows that gender and age may impact attitudes and beliefs towards nutrition, nutrition education, and meal preparation. Some of the children in CACFP have males or grandparents as their sole provider. Their input is valuable to developing successful newsletters for the target audience.

and minimize scheduling conflicts, triads will be arranged to coincide with evening pick-ups.

Triads will be facilitated in English and Spanish by trained researchers using a discussion guide (see Attachments L and M) and used to gather feedback from parents and caregivers on the usability, content, and design of the materials.

Design/Sampling Procedures

Geographic Diversity. Three geographic areas were selected for the research, from a mix of area classifications and geographic regions based on the FNS region designation – New York City, NY: urban classification and Northeast region; Miami-Dade County, FL: urban classification and Mid-Atlantic region; and Gwinnett County, GA: suburban classification and Mid-Atlantic region.

These geographic areas were largely selected because all 3 ranked among the top 5 in terms of CACFP cash payments, attendance, and meals served over the last 3 fiscal years.³ Low income participants will be recruited from the metro areas of New York City, Atlanta, and Miami, each of which has a significant Spanish-speaking population.⁴

CACFP Site Selection. Nine CACFP sites will provide the majority of participants for the study. Selected CACFP sites must participate in and be in good standing with the CACFP program. To identify CACFP sites for recruitment, USDA FNS will arrange a 30-minute meeting with State Agencies that oversee CACFP in selected geographic areas. Staff at State Agencies will provide lists of potential sites. See Recruitment, Screening, and Consent for next steps in the CACFP site recruitment process. A mix of CACFP site types (i.e., child care centers and family child care home(s)) will be included to represent varying perspectives of providers and parents/caregivers.

Recruitment, Screening, and Consent

A multimodal recruitment process will be used.

Recruitment, Screening, and Consent for IDIs and triads will follow this process.

CACFP Sites

- Using the list of potential sites from the State Agencies, contractor support (Diversity/ICF) will directly contact potential sites. Communication will be by telephone (see Attachments U and V).
- Upon confirmation as a research location, CACFP site directors will be provided the consent form by email (see Attachment W) for review and signature (see Attachment K).

Triads

- Simultaneously with CACFP site IDI recruitment, CACFP site directors will be asked to assist with recruitment of parents and caregivers. Recruitment will include sending

³ <https://www.fns.usda.gov/pd/child-nutrition-tables>

⁴ <http://www.census.gov/acs/www/data/data-tables-and-tools/american-factfinder>

English or Spanish flyers home with children and posting flyers at the facility (see Attachments E and F).

- Screeners (see Attachments A and B) will be completed with interested parents and caregivers to confirm that they use CACFP sites to care for their children ages 2-5 and meet the Income Eligibility Guidelines for the CACFP as established at <http://www.fns.usda.gov/fr-032316>. Screeners include questions about family size and household income. Respondents who self-report that their income is above the eligible threshold will not be included in the triad.
- Triads will be scheduled with qualified parents and caregivers. Triads will coincide with pick-up hours to accommodate parent/caregiver schedules and minimize disruptions during standard operating hours.
- CACFP site directors will distribute consent forms (see Attachments G and H) in advance of the triad to allow participants to review the form in advance of the session.
- Signed consent forms will be collected immediately before each triad by the contractor support team. They will also provide additional copies of the consent form in case participants lost the original form.

In-Depth Interviews

- Simultaneously with CACFP site triad recruitment, CACFP site directors will be asked to recommend teachers and staff involved in meal planning/food preparation for participation. The contractor will recruit CACFP providers for IDIs. In each geographic market, one CACFP director may participate in an IDI.
- Screeners (see Attachments C and D) will be completed with interested CACFP providers.
- Interviews will be scheduled with qualified CACFP providers.
- CACFP site directors will distribute consent forms (see Attachments I and J) in advance of the IDI to allow participants to review the form in advance of the session.
- Signed consent forms will be collected immediately before each IDI by the contractor support team. They will also provide additional copies of the consent form in case participants lost the original form.

Compensation

Compensation will be provided at two levels: a stipend for CACFP sites (\$300 per site) and an incentive for triad participants (\$50 per participant).

I. CACFP Sites.

Overview of CACFP Site Stipend: The materials being evaluated are educational tools for CACFP staff and the parents and caregivers of children in their care. Conducting the research at CACFP sites is necessary to achieve the required response rate among provider staff and the target population of parents and caregivers. As a result, conducting the research at CACFP sites will significantly reduce non-response bias among parent/caregiver participants. CACFP sites will serve as venues for IDIs and triads to be conducted; make staff available for IDIs, which may require additional coverage for childcare responsibilities; identify parents and caregivers for

consideration for recruitment for triads; and extend standard operating hours to provide care for children who already receive care at the CACFP site while parents/caregivers participate in the triads.

To reduce the burden on participating sites, we recommend that each host CACFP site receive a \$300 location fee to cover the cost of facility use, additional staff hours required, time to support recruitment of triad participants, and providing staff for IDIs and to watch children during triads. Table 7.2 presents an overview for the CACFP site incentive.

Table 7.2 – CACFP Stipend Overview

Task	Hours*	Rate	Cost
Facility Rental: Triad	4	\$45	\$180
Facility Rental: IDI	2	\$45	\$90
Program Staff: Triad	2	\$10.91	\$22
Program Staff: IDI	1.5	\$10.91	\$16
TOTAL			\$308

*Assuming one triad and IDI at each facility, but research may include additional triads and/or IDIs.

Facility Rental: CACFP sites will provide a room for triads and interviews. It is estimated that preparation for and conduct of each triad and IDI will take contract support approximately 4 hours and 2 hours, respectively. During these research activities, the CACFP site will not be able to use the rooms for other purposes, including preparing for the next day. Conducting the triad at the CACFP site where participants bring their children and where the child care providers work will increase the response rate. For each geographic market, research was conducted to identify the rates of two facility rentals in community centers, libraries, or schools. The average cost of community members renting a room in these spaces was \$45 per hour.

Table 7.3 – Hourly Facility Rental Fees by Geographic Market

Geographic Market	Facility 1	Facility 2
New York, NY	\$35	\$60
Miami-Dade County, FL	\$37.50	\$40
Gwinnett County, GA	\$55	\$45
Average	\$45	

Program Staff: CACFP site directors will spend time away from their normal work to support recruitment of triad participants. These tasks include coordinating with the research team to identify parents and caregivers who may be potential participants; identifying staff as potential participants for the IDIs; and disseminating/posting flyers. Sites will also make up to two child care providers available for participation in a 60-minute IDI at their facility. They will also extend standard operating hours to provide care to children who already receive care at the site while parents and caregivers participate in triads. The stipend will cover the cost of hiring substitutes to provide staff coverage as needed.

The US Department of Labor Bureau of Labor Statistics provides mean hourly rates for different Standard Occupational Classifications (SOC)⁵, sortable by state. The table below lays out the May 2016 mean hourly wages for the SOC that most closely relates to CACFP providers⁶: *Childcare Workers*. Florida, Georgia, and New York were selected because participants will be recruited from these states.

Table 7.4 – Hourly Mean Wage for Childcare Workers by Geographic Market

State	Hourly mean wage Childcare Workers (SOC code 39-9011)
Florida	\$10.39
Georgia	\$9.94
New York	\$13.26
Average	\$11.20

II. Triad Participants.

Overview of Triad Participant Incentive: The population for this research is families and caregivers with children enrolled in child care centers and family child care homes that participate in the CACFP, a specific group of individuals. To achieve the required response rate and reduce non-response bias within this defined population, we recommend that each triad participant be provided a monetary incentive to offset costs that may be incurred by their household as a result of participation.

Based on past experience, we strongly advise a \$50 incentive to help cover travel costs, care for other household members, and food for other household members. This incentive will reduce possible burdens on potential participants which, in turn, will reduce non-response bias and enhance the validity and reliability of the data collected. Table 7.5 presents an overview of average costs that triad participants are likely to incur.

Table 7.5 – Participant Incentive Overview of Potential Costs

Task	Rate	Amount	Unit	Cost
Travel Costs	\$5.00	1	Person	\$5.00
Food for Others	\$8.00	1	Family	\$8.00
Care for Others	\$14.00	3	Hours	\$42.00
TOTAL for all Potential Costs				\$55.00

⁵ See <http://www.bls.gov/soc/home.htm> for a list and explanation of Standard Occupational Codes

⁶ See https://www.bls.gov/oes/current/oes_nat.htm for national mean hourly wages

By offsetting costs such as travel expenses (for participants and/or members of their household), care for other household members, and food for other household members, we expect the validity and reliability of data collected will be improved beyond what may be possible by other means. We expect \$50 will cover the average mix of costs to be incurred by individual participants. The incentive will be distributed in the form of a monetary incentive (Visa or MasterCard gift card). Participants will also be provided with a meal, as the triads will take place during dinner time. The meal will be arranged by contractor support and is valued at \$8 per participant.

Travel Costs: Triad participants will need to pay transportation costs that are not incurred on a normal day since they will be staying at the child care site for 1.5 hours longer than usual. Participants will need to secure transportation for other members of their households (e.g., adults and older children) due to their delayed departure from the CACFP site. Participants may also incur a parking fee if attending the triad. We propose providing a \$5 incentive to cover any incidental expenses incurred by participants during their transportation to and from the triad or household members who will require alternate transportation. This figure is derived from the GSA contractor rates for daily per diems.

Food for Other Household Members: Due to the extended stay at the CACFP site participants will need to make arrangements to provide food/meals for other household members. As per the USDA's November 2016 Cost for Food at Home, the cost of food for a family of four for a week on the Thrifty Food Plan is \$128.20 or \$163.50 on the Low-Cost Food Plan.⁷ With a low estimate, this equals a \$6 - \$8 meal prepared at home. If a parent/caregiver is unable to prepare a meal at home for the household, they may need to arrange for a prepared food item. Alternatively, if other household members are elderly, have a disability, or a special diet, their caregiver would need to stay longer to prepare the meal.

Care for Other Household Members: The total amount of time parents may require child care or senior care for others in their household is estimated at 3 hours, including travel to and from the site, participation in the 90-minute triad, and an early arrival time. Parents/caregivers may need to find alternate care arrangements for other household members who are cared for at other locations (e.g., adults who may be at a day center for seniors, older children who are at after-school programs).

Two sources were consulted in order to estimate the average cost of hourly childcare for potential research participants. The *US Department of Labor Bureau of Labor Statistics* provides mean hourly rates for different Standard Occupational Classifications (SOC)⁸, sortable by state. The table below lays out the mean hourly wages for the two SOCs that most closely relate to the short-term childcare that participants would require: *Personal Care Aides* and *Childcare*

⁷ See <https://www.cnpp.usda.gov/sites/default/files/CostofFoodNov2016.pdf>

⁸ See <http://www.bls.gov/soc/home.htm> for a list and explanation of Standard Occupational Codes

Workers⁹. Florida, Georgia, and New York were selected because participants will be recruited from these states.

Table 7.6 – Hourly Mean Wage for Care Workers by Geographic Market

State	Hourly mean wage Childcare Workers (SOC code 39-9011)	Hourly mean wage: Personal Care Aides (SOC code 39-9021)
Florida	\$10.39	\$10.80
Georgia	\$9.94	\$9.72
New York	\$13.26	\$12.27
Average	\$11.20	\$10.93

However, we feel that these figures provide an artificially low estimate for the cost to participants for short-term childcare (e.g., babysitters, nannies, community care) for two reasons. First, these hourly wages combine a broad range of occupations within each general SOC, most of which would not apply to the care participants would need. Second, the hourly wage of many of these workers does not represent what parents would pay, as the wages do not include operational costs.

Additionally, we consulted Care.com, an international web-based service that matches care providers with families seeking care. Care.com has a membership of over 14 million and provides suggested hourly rates for babysitters by postal code varying by the number of children. In order to capture a sample of potential participants, 3 postal codes per geographic market were selected. The average hourly rate for these postal codes for one, two, and three children was \$17.04.

Table 7.7 – Hourly Cost of Babysitters by Zip Code

Location	Zip Code	\$ per hour 1 child	\$ per hour 2 children	\$ per hour 3 children	Mean \$ per hour
New York City (Bronx)	10459	\$17.00	\$18.50	\$20.50	\$18.67
New York City (Bronx)	10463	\$17.00	\$18.50	\$20.50	\$18.67
New York City (Bronx)	10451	\$17.00	\$18.50	\$20.50	\$18.67
Norcross, GA	30003	\$14.50	\$16.00	\$17.50	\$16.00
Snellville, GA	30039	\$14.50	\$16.00	\$17.00	\$15.83
Lawrenceville, GA	30046	\$14.50	\$16.00	\$17.50	\$16.00
Miami, FL	33101	\$15.00	\$16.50	\$18.00	\$16.50
Miami, FL	33133	\$15.00	\$16.50	\$18.00	\$16.50
Miami, FL	33153	\$15.00	\$16.50	\$18.00	\$16.50

⁹ See https://www.bls.gov/oes/current/oes_nat.htm for national mean hourly wages

				Full Sample Mean	\$17.04
--	--	--	--	-------------------------	----------------

Taken together, the available data provides a range of mean hourly wages from \$10.93 to \$17.04 per hour. Given the range of figures provided by the available data sources, we propose using a conservative estimate of \$14 per hour for child/senior care, in order to ensure that the cost of care for low-income families of varying family circumstances will not prohibit parents and caregivers from participating.

Data Analysis

Qualitative Data. All triads and IDIs will be audio-recorded (with respondent permission) and detailed notes will be taken. Triads will also be transcribed, with Spanish triads being transcribed into English. The IDI notes and triad transcripts will become the data for qualitative analysis. Data will be coded using deductive coding, based on the IDI/triad questions, and inductive coding, based on the themes observed by the analyst. The coded notes will be used to identify themes and patterns of responses, the extensiveness of responses across participants, and those responses that were unique and contradictory to what was commonly expressed. Findings will be considered descriptive and directional, but not definitive. No attempt will be made to generalize findings as nationally representative.

Outcomes/Findings

Information and formative input gathered from target audiences through the research will help refine materials so the materials are relevant, meaningful, and easy-to-use. Research summary findings may be published either electronically or in print, but such documents will not include information that personally identifies any of the research participants.

8. Confidentiality:

System of Record FNS-8, FNS Studies and Reports, published in the Federal Register on 4/25/1991 at 56 FR 19078, covers personal information collected under this study and identifies safeguards for the information collected.

This study protocol has been reviewed and approved by the ICF Institutional Review Board (IRB) to ensure the protection of human subjects involved in this research (see Attachment X).

Additionally, the research team will take several precautions to maintain the privacy of research participants including de-identification of screener responses, triad/IDI notes, and triad transcripts. The research team will not disclose any personally identifiable information in any report or presentation. The research team will not share any information collected with anyone outside the study unless it is necessary to protect participants, or if required by law. All of the information collected will be kept for three years. The information, audio files, notes, and transcripts will be stored on a password-protected computer and/or in locked cabinets that only the research team can access. After three years, all of the collected information will be destroyed by securely shredding documents or permanently deleting electronic information.

As with all research, there is a chance that privacy could be breached. For example, despite the best efforts of the research team to keep the information collected during the study private, a breach may occur as a result of accidental human error or hacking. In the event a breach occurs, all participants will be contacted and notified as to the extent of the breach, any damages incurred, and future potential risks; contact information for additional inquiries will also be provided.

Results from this study may appear in professional journals or at scientific conferences. However, no individual participants will be identified or linked to the results. Results may also be used in future research or shared with other researchers. However, other researchers will not have access to any identifying information of participants.

Federal Costs: \$170,866.99

9. Research Tools/Instruments:

- **Attachment A:** Screener: Parent/Caregiver Triad (English)
- **Attachment B:** Screener: Parent/Caregiver Triad (Spanish)
- **Attachment C:** Screener: Child Care Provider (English)
- **Attachment D:** Screener: Child Care Provider (Spanish)
- **Attachment E:** Recruitment Flyer: Parent/Caregiver Triad (English)
- **Attachment F:** Recruitment Flyer: Parent/Caregiver Triad (Spanish)
- **Attachment G:** Consent Form: Parent/Caregiver Triads (English)
- **Attachment H:** Consent Form: Parent/Caregiver Triads (Spanish)
- **Attachment I:** Consent Form: Child Care Provider (English)
- **Attachment J:** Consent Form: Child Care Provider (Spanish)
- **Attachment K:** Consent Form: CACFP Site
- **Attachment L:** Triad Moderator's Guide: Parent/Caregiver (English)
- **Attachment M:** Triad Moderator's Guide: Parent/Caregiver (Spanish)
- **Attachment N:** Interview Facilitator's Guide: Child Care Provider (English)
- **Attachment O:** Interview Facilitator's Guide: Child Care Provider (Spanish)
- **Attachment P:** Stimulus: *Nibbles for Health* Newsletters (English)
- **Attachment Q:** Stimulus: *Nibbles for Health* Newsletters (Spanish)
- **Attachment R:** Stimulus: *Nutrition and Wellness Tips for Young Children: Provider Handbook for the Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP)* (English)
- **Attachment S:** Stimulus: *Nutrition and Wellness Tips for Young Children: Provider Handbook for the Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP)* (Spanish)
- **Attachment T:** Stimulus: Sample illustrations for use in *Nutrition and Wellness Tips for Young Children: Provider Handbook for the Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP)*
- **Attachment U:** Screener for CACFP Sites
- **Attachment V:** CACFP Site Screener - Follow-up
- **Attachment W:** CACFP Site Confirmation Email
- **Attachment X:** IRB Approval

- **Attachment Y:** Sample illustrations for use in *Nibbles for Health* Newsletters