

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision
 87 FR 19697
 4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
Comment 1.	Commenter: USCIS-2008-0028-0085 Anonymous	
	On the current G-639, on page 2, the subject of record under part 3, question 1: asked to state the purpose of their request and on page 3, still under part 3, question 16, again asked the subject of record to describe the records they are seeking. Both questions 1 and 16 are asked differently but basically asking the same thing. If one of these questions could be eliminated that would be helpful.	Response: The field, "State the purpose of your request" was eliminated and does not appear in the draft Form G-639 posted for comment. Instead, requestors are asked to describe the records sought under "Request Specific Documents". See draft Form G-639 at https://www.regulations.gov/document/USCIS-2008-0028-0081 .
Comment 2.	Commenter: USCIS-2008-0028-0087 Suzanne Hoffman	
	OMB Control Number 1615-0102 USCIS, Docket ID USCIS-2008-0028 Comment for improvement of the Form G-639; Online FOIA Request Clarification is needed for a requestor who may be a professional being hired to acquire records on behalf of Subject of Record or subject's family. Part 2 "Representative Role" is not carried forward in the remainder of the questions in terms of how they relate to the Subject of Record. Answering 2.b. then 3.b. does not make sense, but may if you are hired by a relative of the deceased.	Response: In the new draft Form G-639, USCIS consolidated potential responses and changed phrasing to improve requestors' options to answer the question. The kind of requestor the commentor identified could now select only: "B. I am requesting information about someone who is deceased;" For context, the question now appears as follows: 3. Third-Party Requestor's Relationship to the Subject of Record What is the relationship of the subject of record to the third-party requestor? If you are requesting information or amendment or correction of records on behalf of the subject of record (select only one for Items A. – F.):

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision
 87 FR 19697
 4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
		<p><input type="checkbox"/> A. I am an attorney or accredited representative, acting on behalf of the subject of record</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> B. I am requesting information about someone who is deceased;</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> C. I am requesting information on behalf of my child or a minor for whom I am a legal guardian</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> D. Other (Explain): [Fillable field]</p> <p>If you are requesting information about a subject of record with whom you have no relationship:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> E. I am requesting as a member of the media</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> F. Other (Explain): [Fillable field]</p>
	<p>To avoid redaction and a subsequent re-request for non-redacted files, having death dates of additional family members and parents for the section "Information about Family Members that May appear on Requested Records," will avoid the second request for a cleaner copy of the initial file. It add a single line to each family member identified. This death date addition will simplify the process of document review.</p>	<p>Response: USCIS considers the privacy interests of all individuals mentioned in records when reviewing requests made under the Freedom of Information Act. To receive information pertaining to each person mentioned in records, your request must generally provide each person’s consent to disclose information to you or evidence that they are deceased. This information should be included as an uploaded document when filing online or as additional information when mailing your G-639. As a result of this comment, USCIS will add additional language to Form G-639 and its corresponding online system, FIRST, to better articulate this process to the public.</p>
<p>Comment 3.</p>	<p>Commenter: USCIS-2008-0028-0087 ILRC, AILA, American Immigration Council</p>	
<p>3</p>	<p>The undersigned organizations respectfully submit the following comments in connection with Docket ID USCIS-2008-0028; OMB Control Number 1615-0102; Agency</p>	<p>No response required</p>

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision

87 FR 19697

4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
	<p>Information Collection Activities; Revision of a Currently Approved Collection: Form G-639; Online FOIA Request published in the Federal Register on April 5, 2022. I. Introduction of Stakeholders and Expertise The Immigrant Legal Resource Center (ILRC) is a national non-profit organization that provides legal trainings, educational materials, and advocacy to advance immigrant rights. The ILRC’s mission is to work with and educate immigrants, community organizations, and the legal sector to continue to build a democratic society that values diversity and the rights of all people. Since its inception in 1979, the ILRC has provided technical assistance on hundreds of thousands of immigration law issues, trained thousands of advocates and pro bono attorneys annually on immigration law, distributed thousands of practitioner guides, provided expertise to immigrant-led advocacy efforts across the country, and supported hundreds of immigration legal non-profit organizations in building their capacity. The ILRC has produced legal trainings, practice advisories, manuals and other materials pertaining to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) as it pertains to the practice of immigration law. We also advocate for expansion of government transparency in all sectors. ILRC operates a national technical assistance line to assist immigration attorneys as they navigate through records requests for their clients and write some of the only national resources on FOIA requests for individual immigration cases. Because of our focus on this complex area of the law, we have a distinct interest in ensuring that Form G-639 and accompanying instructions are clear and understandable to applicants. The American</p>	

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision

87 FR 19697

4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
	<p>Immigration Council is a not-for-profit educational and charitable organization. The Council was established to increase public understanding of immigration law and policy, advocate for the fair and just administration of U.S. immigration laws, protect the legal rights of noncitizens and citizens, and educate the public about the enduring contributions of immigrants. Through research, analysis, litigation and transparency work, the Council seeks to hold the government accountable for unlawful conduct and restrictive interpretations of the law and for failing to ensure that the immigration laws are implemented and executed in a manner that comports with due process. The Council publishes practice materials and conducts numerous trainings each year explaining the process for requesting information under FOIA from immigration agencies. Clarity regarding the process for requesting information from U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS)—an agency with one of the largest FOIA caseloads of any agency within the federal government—is critical to the Council’s ability to provide sound advice to immigration practitioners. The American Immigration Lawyers Association (AILA), established in 1946, is a voluntary bar association of more than 16,000 attorneys and law professors practicing, researching, and teaching in the field of immigration and nationality law. Our mission includes the advancement of the law pertaining to immigration and nationality and the facilitation of justice in the field. AILA members regularly advise and represent businesses, U.S. citizens, U.S. lawful permanent residents, and foreign nationals regarding the application and interpretation of U.S. immigration laws. Our members’</p>	

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision

87 FR 19697

4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
	<p>collective expertise and experience makes us particularly well-qualified to offer views that will benefit the public and the government.</p>	
	<p>II. Comments on the Proposed Form/Instructions We note that USCIS has added language to the Form G-639 Instructions that advises applicants that there is an alternative method for filing FOIA requests through an online system—Freedom of Information Records System (FIRST). Some of the new instructions are repeated on the USCIS web page. See USCIS website, Request Records through the Freedom of Information Act or Privacy Act, https://www.uscis.gov/records/request-records-through-the-freedom-ofinformation-act-or-privacy-act. To ensure the instructions accurately reflect the requirements under the FOIA statute and are clear to FOIA requesters, we suggest changes to the proposed revisions to the Form G-639 Instructions.</p>	<p>No response required</p>
	<p>1. The Instructions should lessen language advocating the use of FIRST. USCIS’ suggested changes to the Instructions include language that heavily promotes the use of FIRST. While there are advantages to a more efficient and streamlined process for submitting FOIA requests, FIRST is still a relatively new program and there is no publicly available assessment or data explaining FIRST’s efficiencies in detail. While it is understandable that USCIS would like to inform FOIA requesters and their representatives that FIRST is an available alternative to the Form G-639, we suggest that language lauding FIRST not be the focus of Instructions for the Form G-639—a Form intended for FOIA requests when an individual chooses not to use</p>	<p>Response: As stated on the draft Form G-639, requests for records may be submitted online at www.uscis.gov/foia, using Form G-639, or in writing in accordance with the requirements of the Freedom of Information Act. However, the most efficient way to submit a request is online. Online requests allow requestors to submit requests instantly, track their progress, receive responses as soon as they are ready, and download records whenever they are needed. USCIS is committed to processing requests in all forms received, and we feel it is important to educate the public about how they can submit their requests as efficiently as possible.</p>

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision

87 FR 19697

4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
	<p>FIRST. It is also important to note that statutory timeframes for making a determination on a FOIA request are the same for FOIA requests submitted 1) with a G-639, 2) in writing without use of the Form, and 3) through FIRST. Language in the Instructions that states the FIRST system processes FOIA requests more quickly and efficiently is problematic to the extent it implies a person may not receive a response to a FOIA request in the relatively short statutory timeframe—twenty or thirty days—using other methods. See Instructions, pp. 1-2 X (“Our online FOIA and PA services are a more efficient way to request and receive records than by using Form G-639 to make a request.”). We recommend deleting the five paragraphs of additions to the instructions at p. 2 X that begin with “Our online FOIA and PA services are a more efficient way ...”.</p>	
	<p>2. The Form G-639 should not require country of birth information; FIRST should not require mandatory information verifying identity to complete an online FOIA request.</p> <p>The revision to the Form G-639 should remove the field “Country of Birth.” At a minimum, the Form G-639 and Instructions should explicitly state that an individual’s country of birth is not required to process a FOIA request. An individual might not want to share their country of birth with a government agency because this admission may seriously impact their immigration case. In removal proceedings, the government has the burden of proving an individual’s alienage. 1 Practitioners report that the government sometimes uses FOIA requests as evidence of alienage when country of birth is provided in the Form G-</p>	<p>Response:</p> <p>If you are requesting records about a person with whom you have no relationship, we will no longer require country of birth in FIRST or on Form G-639. However, we will continue to require country of birth in other instances, in accordance with the verification of identity and verification of guardianship provisions of 6 CFR § 5.21.</p> <p>Please note, the more information we receive in a FOIA request, including country of birth, the better we may locate the records and information you request.</p>

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision

87 FR 19697

4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
	<p>639. Because a person’s country of birth is only one means of verifying identity and sharing country of birth information could be damaging to a person’s immigration case, the request for country of birth should be removed from the Form G-639.</p> <p>Though the Form G-639 could be more explicit that country of birth information is not required, immigration practitioners report that USCIS often will process a FOIA request even when the “Country of Birth” field is not completed. In contrast, the FIRST system does not permit an individual to submit a FOIA request without providing this information.</p> <p>USCIS released FIRST—a digital FOIA submission and tracking system for USCIS records—in June 2019.² USCIS claims that it allows FOIA requesters to submit their requests faster than physical mail submissions.³ This online system requires the user to set up an online MyUSCIS account to track requests and receive requested documents digitally. It also requires the following information: purpose of request, name, aliases, mailing address, country of birth, and information about family members.⁴ The system does not allow an individual to complete an online FOIA submission without providing this information.</p> <p>Many individuals may not want to provide all of this information because they do not want to enter their country of birth and concede alienage or provide information about their family members.</p>	

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision

87 FR 19697

4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
	<p>By creating and promoting an online form that only can be submitted when all requested information is provided, the agency is compelling individuals to concede alienage. In order to submit a FOIA request to obtain information necessary to defend against removal or assess eligibility for immigration relief without conceding alienage, a person would need to ignore USCIS' strong recommendation to use the FIRST system and 1) complete a Form G-639 without providing country of birth, or 2) submit a request in writing without a Form G-639. We suggest FIRST eliminate the field requesting country of birth information or, at a minimum, not require that information to submit the form online.</p>	
	<p>The Instructions should clearly state FIRST is one option among others for submitting a FOIA request</p> <p>FOIA requires that requests for agency records be reasonably described and in writing and the agency has outlined acceptable methods for submission, including 1) with a G-639, 2) in writing without use of the Form G-639, and 3) through FIRST. Though FIRST may provide some efficiencies, not all individuals will want to create a MyUSCIS account and submit a FOIA request online, either because of personal preference, access to computers, or inability to deal with challenges associated with creating an online account.</p> <p>The USCIS webpage already heavily discourages applicants from using a Form G-639. Under the listing for the Form G-639, the first line directs requesters to use the FIRST</p>	<p>Response:</p> <p>The draft Form G-639 begins by explaining its purpose: to enable the public to request access to U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) records under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA).</p> <p>It then lists the options to make a FOIA or PA Request with USCIS as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Online at www.uscis.gov/foia; • Using this Form G-639; or • In writing and in accordance with the requirements of the FOIA and PA. <p>As a means of guiding requestors to the best possible experience, the draft Form G-639 and the uscis.gov/foia webpage explain that our online FOIA and PA services are the most efficient way to request and receive records among other options. They in no way indicate that a requestor may jeopardize their immigration case using Form G-639, Freedom of Information/Privacy Act Request.</p>

Responses to 30-Day FRN Public Comments

G-639; Online FOIA Request Revision

87 FR 19697

4/5/22-5/5/22

Comment #	Public Comments	USCIS Response
	<p>process.5 Only after scrolling through a page of information does an applicant arrive at the Form G-639 with information about where to file it by mail. 6</p> <p>The agency's failure to clearly communicate the methods for accessing and completing the Form G-639 on its website is regrettable and the extensive discussion about the FIRST process in the Form G-639 Instructions is confusing and unnecessary. Though USCIS may prefer FIRST, it is the decision of the requester and their representative how to approach the FOIA submission process. Where critical decisions regarding an immigration case will be informed by the records obtained through a FOIA, an individual should clearly understand their options and proceed with confidence that they will not jeopardize their immigration case in the process of trying to resolve it.</p> <p>Sincerely, Peggy Gleason Senior Staff Attorney, on behalf of ILRC</p>	