

Photovoice Training Guide

Date: TBD

Agenda

- **Welcome and Introductions (10 min)**
- **Overview of the Fatherhood TIES Study (10 min)**
- **Your role in the Photovoice study (35 min)**
- **Break (5 min)**
- **Using Photovoice (50 min)**
- **Wrap-up/Time for questions (10 min)**

1. Welcome and check-in slides (10 min)

- **Slides#1-2: Agenda**

Welcome to the Fatherhood TIES photovoice training. Thank you for agreeing to use a new data collection approach and sharing your experiences. The information you share about receiving [name of intervention/services] will help us better understand the how [name of intervention] has affected your life.

As a reminder, during this call, you can choose to mute/unmute yourself by clicking the microphone and video icons in the bottom corner of your screen. You can also access the chat from that same spot and choose who you'd like to send a chat to everyone or a particular participant. You can always send a private message to the someone from the MDRC research team if you have a question or concern, you'd like to discuss individually.

Before we get started talking about the work that we're going to be doing together, we'd like to get the chance to get to know one another.

- **Slide #3: Welcome**

To start out, let's go around and introduce ourselves. Please share your name and why you want to take part in the Fatherhood TIES photovoice study?

2. Overview of the Fatherhood TIES study (10 min)

- **Slide #4: Fatherhood TIES study**

"T.I.E.S." in Fatherhood TIES stands for Testing, Identified, Elements, for Success in Fatherhood Programs.

- **Slide #5: Overview of Fatherhood TIES**

The goal of the study is to identify and test the program elements, by that we mean, the key elements or essential parts of fatherhood programs that are most effective at improving the lives of fathers who participate in these programs. By testing the “program elements”, we hope to learn whether and how they are effective, and how programs might use them to support fathers in their programs. In the end, we hope that this research improves fathers’ well-being and fathers’ relationships with their children and co-parenting partners.

- **Slide #6 Goals of the Photovoice Study**

We want to use the photovoice study to learn how fatherhood “program elements” are impacting fathers’ lives. We want to use the study to contribute to narrative change. By using this data collection technique, we want give fathers the power to share their experiences in a way that might be more engaging and meaningful to them. We want fathers to feel comfortable identifying concerns that are affecting their lives. These concerns might be around processes or structures that affect their personal wellbeing or their relationships with the children or co-parenting partners. We also want the voices and experiences of fathers to be heard by those who make decisions that affect services and how they may benefit fathers, like legislators and policy makers. Ultimately, we hope the project contributes more broadly to narrative change around the role of fathers in families and communities.

What are your hopes for this research?

- **Slide #7: Photovoice Activities**

How does it work? Photovoice is a visual data collection method, where you will be prompted to take a photo and write a caption describing why you chose that photo at least once a week for three weeks. The prompt will ask you to think about and picture how the parent coaching you received shows up in your everyday life and then take photos reflecting that. Photos can be taken of things you do by yourself or with your children, places you go, or even objects that are meaningful to you. We’ll talk more about getting permission to take and use photos of yourself and others later in the training. After taking a photo, you’ll upload it via a link and draft a caption to the MDRC research team. We’ll then meet as a group to talk about the photos. Together, we’ll reflect on what the photos tell us about our personal experiences and fatherhood more broadly.

Based on the group’s analysis of the photos, the MDRC team will write up themes and recommendations about the topics. We will share these with you and decide together how to present the themes and photos in an online virtual gallery. We may also decide to incorporate findings and photos into our final research report and meet with funders and policy makers to share what we’ve found.

What is involved in photovoice? There are 4 activities involved: #1, this training; #2, Collecting photos, #3 An analysis meeting to review and discuss the photos and, #4 featuring photos in an online gallery.

3. Your role in the study (35 min)

- **Slide #8: Your role in the study**

In this study, you'll have to roles as both a research subject and as a researcher.

- **Slide #9: Research-Participant Role**

As a research subject, you have certain rights and protections. And as a researcher, you are responsible for making ethical decisions about the research you're conducting. We'll talk about both those roles now.

- **Slide #10: Researcher-Participant Role**

The photovoice study is unique in how you take on a researcher and participant role. In this study, you act as a researcher when you take and analyze photos, while maintaining research ethics. At the same time, you act as a participant when you share your opinions, information about yourself and maintain your protected rights as a participant in a research study. We use the term 'researcher-participant' to refer to someone like yourself who is taking part in a participatory research project and handling duties of both roles.

As a research subject, or participant, you'll be sharing your experiences in the program and with your children and/or co-parents through the photographs and text that you send us. Your photos are the "data" that will help us understand how the system effects health and wellbeing. In this study, the MDRC research team will do everything we can to keep the information you share with us—including your photos—private, so that you are in control of what is shared about you publicly. You have the option to stop participating in the study at any point, to access information about the risks and benefits of taking part, and to access protections to keep the information you share private. We discussed your protections as research subjects in the informed consent process. If you have any questions, we're always happy to discuss any questions.

Now onto the next role. As researchers, you'll be interpreting the photos and identifying important themes and ideas on how the system should be changed from them, and you can also be listed as an author on the virtual gallery that we create with your photo submissions, if you'd like. That also means that you'll have access to other people's data—their photos. We'll take the next few minutes to talk about the kinds of responsibilities we all accept as researchers to do research ethically.

- **Slide #11- Ethical Principles for Human Subjects Research**

There are lots of kinds of research. When we do research that focuses on people (instead of saying, particle waves or jet fuel), it's called "human subjects research."

- **Slide #12- Belmont Principles for Human Subjects Research**

We rely on three ethical principles to make sure that the research is fair to the people who take part in it. Unfortunately, researchers haven't always historically treated the people they have studied fairly. You might be familiar with some of the most notorious examples like experiments carried out in Nazi concentration camps on unwilling prisoners and the Tuskegee syphilis study that denied black men in rural black communities a readily available treatment. There are more modest examples too, such as coercing people to take part in a study through power or payment or failing to safeguard sensitive information shared with researchers such as social security numbers or health records. In 1978, a federal commission published the Belmont Report to address ethical problems in human subject's research. This report was called the Belmont Report and focused on three main principles for ethical research: respect for persons, beneficence, and justice. Today, federal regulations govern the treatment of research that involves human subjects and ethics boards, called "institutional review boards," review all research plans that will involve people to make sure that researchers follow the regulations and treat the people who will take part in the research with respect, minimize harms associated with the research, and employ principles of justice in the research design. We'll talk about each of these three principles for ethical research, and how they relate to the work we're doing together on this study.

- o Respect for persons: Researchers show respect for person by:
 - Voluntary participation in the study.
 - Informed consent: study participants know what they're signing up for.

When we do research, we want to make sure we respect the subjects of the research by making sure they understand what they are signing up for when they agree to participate. We also want to make sure we protect people's right to choose whether or not they want to participate in the study. In this study, we protect your rights by talking through informed consent with you, like we did at the beginning of the study and the individual interview. We also protect this by making sure you know you can leave the study at any time, and that there are no consequences for doing so. You also have the chance to choose what info you want to share publicly. If you tell us that you would not like to include a photo and caption, we won't post it on the online gallery.

As a researcher, you will practice this principle in this study by letting people choose whether or not they want to participate when you take their photos, and make sure they understand how the photos you take of them will be used.

We also have obligations to show respect for persons in how we treat fellow photovoice participant-researchers. If someone chooses to leave the study, respect their decision and don't pressure them to participate. If you are confused about the project or how your photos will be used, ask us! If you have a question, someone else probably does too, and we'll all benefit from talking through your questions together.

- o Beneficence: Obligation to maximize potential benefits and minimize potential harms.
 - The research we do should maximize potential benefits and minimize potential harms to society.

As researchers, we want to make sure we maximize the potential benefits and minimize the potential risks that study participants encounter. In this study, we need your help to make sure that we maximize the potential benefits to you and your fellow participants and minimize the risks.

You can do this by protecting the privacy of what your fellow participants share in terms of photos, stories, and thoughts in our group settings. What is shared in this group stays in this group. As researchers, you have the responsibility to protect what your fellow participants say, by letting them choose what they'd like to share publicly. This applies to what you might see in their Zoom background, their names, stories or thoughts that they share, and the specific contents of the photos that we discuss. It's also important to follow data security procedures and not send data, photos, or personal information via phone or email to minimize risk to all the participants.

- o Justice:
 - The benefits and burdens of research are distributed fairly:
 - o no community or group unduly experiences the burdens
 - o no community or group is excluded from the benefits.
 - It's important to select research subjects fairly and equally.

As researchers, we have to make sure that the people we choose to participate in research studies are chosen fairly. For example, research of innovative therapies or medicines must be available not only to people who can afford them. On the other hand, groups shouldn't be selected for research simply because it is convenient to do so, such as people who confined to institutions. Justice is a core goal of the photovoice methodology. In this study, we focus on empowering people to share their voice and perspectives in this dual role as research subjects and researchers. As researchers, you should practice justice while choosing who you take photos of. Though they are not research subjects in our study, it is important to treat them ethically. We ask that subjects be at least 18 and able to fully understand how their photo will be used. We also ask that you be mindful when selecting subjects that they are fully able to consent (consider cognitive ability) and that they fully understand the risks and benefits of participating.

4. Using Photovoice (50 min)

- **Slide #13: Using Photovoice**

Now that we've talked about some of the principles of how we'll work together, we're going to talk through the process of actually taking pictures for the project. We need to use specific processes that we developed to make sure that the study reflects the principles of beneficence, respect for persons, and justice.

This research project will take place over the XX months, between [insert month] and [insert month]. Starting [insert date], you'll start receiving the research question prompt via text from our team. You'll have about a week to take a picture that responds to the prompt, write up a caption for it, and send it

into the MDRC research team. We'll meet as a team [insert meeting days/weeks] to discuss some of the photos submitted and analyze what they say about how the pretrial process affects individuals' health and wellbeing, and how you believe it can be changed for the better.

- **Slide #15: Using photos to tell a story**

Now we'll walk through an example of how other people in photovoice studies have used photos to tell a story. On the screen, you'll see example photographs of how researchers might respond to a prompt on sleep quality. Take a moment to look at the variety of ways people responded to the prompt, and think about which photos are the most interesting to you.

[Give participants 3 minutes to look at the variety of responses to the prompts.]

- Which photo are you most interested in? Why?

- What do the different photos bring up for you? Do they evoke different emotions? Thoughts?

As you can see, there are many different things you can take photos of: people, a place, a thing. As you get to work on your own photos, know that there is no right way to respond to any photos. You can choose photos that show something literal: a stack of bills, a playground, a photo of something around your house. Or you can choose photos that are symbolic: a cloudy sky, cluttered street, scary-looking road, animals, fire... etc.

You can take photos inside or outside; of things close up or far away; of people, buildings, nature. You can take photos of things you find ugly or things you think are beautiful. Anything that you think expresses your perspective, opinion, or feeling and will spark conversation is encouraged.

It's important that you take photos that show your perspective on a topic. We're going to share a few strategies that you can use to create photos that are visually interesting and help you tell your story.

- **Slide #16: Color**

Using color: Color can be a powerful way to draw someone's attention to a particular part of the photo. Color can also convey emotion. Think about how you might use color or lightness/darkness in your photographs to convey a particular mood or emotion.

- **Slide #17: Rule of Thirds**

Using the rule of thirds: To make photos more visually appealing, you can use something called the rule of thirds. Instead of putting the subject of your photo directly in the center, pretend that there are these lines dividing up your screen into thirds horizontally and vertically. Align your subject with one of those lines.

- **Slide #18: Perspective**

Using perspective: You can use perspective (the angle or position that the photo is taken from) to make photos more interesting by showing something from a new or unusual position. Using a perspective can also make it clear what part of the picture you want viewers to focus on. Playing with perspective can also change the scale of how big something looks: it can make something appear to be big and overwhelming, or small and insignificant.

- **Slide #19: Taking photos**

You will be taking photos to answer this research question.

- **Slide #20: Getting from the research question to your picture.**

Think about the research question. Come up with an answer to the question for yourself. Now visualize. What does the answer look like in your everyday life. With that in mind, take a photo to capture the meaning. You can take photos of things you do, places you go or even objects that are meaningful to you.

- **Slide #21: Example photo**
[Show slide and ask for feedback or questions]

- **Slide #22: How to Submit Photos**

In this study you'll be creating and sending data in the form of photographs. When we conduct research, it is important to use safe, secure processes to send data. Unlike when you're communicating with friends or coworkers, you can only send research data (names, photos, or information that could identify any of the fellow study participants) using a special software that is secure. We are using one called Qualtrics.

In this study, you will receive a prompt via text message or email to your cell phone. In that text message will be a link to a web page where you can upload a photo from your phone and type in a caption.

[Stop PowerPoint and share screen with Qualtrics page where participants can upload. Walk through each part of the page and demonstrate how to upload an image into the form.]

- **Slide #23: Photo Release Forms**

Sometimes, you will need to get someone's permission if you would like to include a photo of them in the study. To do this, you'll ask them to sign a short form called a photo release that says we can use a photo of them in our analysis sessions and use it publicly when talking about the study. Now, we're going to give you an overview of this process: what you can include in photos, when you need to get a photo release, what the form looks like, and how you can use it.

[Pause PowerPoint presentation, and share screen with the Qualtrics link form.]

You can access this form from your phone. You either have the option to collect someone's permission before taking the photo by having them fill out the form on your phone, or take the photo and collect someone's permission afterwards. Either way, you'll talk through how the photo will be used, and ask if

they agree to letting us use the photo. If they say yes and you feel comfortable doing so, you'll pass over your phone and have them agree to let us use the photo by filling out the form and submitting it on Qualtrics. If they don't agree to share the photo, you'll delete the photo. Remember that you can always take a photo that does not require a release if you don't feel comfortable asking someone to sign a release.

We will only discuss photos that include people if we have received a photo release for that person pictured. If you submit a photo that includes a person in it without submitting a photo release, the research team can hold onto it for 90 days before deleting it. We will reach out to you if we are missing a photo release for a photo.

- **Slide #24: Photo Permission Stoplight**

Green light: You **can** take and submit photos of the following:

- anything inside where you live (home, apartment, room)
 - o You will want to be careful not to include street signs or house numbers that could give away someone's location without meaning to.
- anything in a public place (on the street, in a park, anything outside)
- self-portraits
- abstract or symbolic photos, like a landscape, park, sports field...
- crowd shots or people in public places
- photo of someone in a non-public place where they are not identifiable (back of head, hands)

Yellow light: You **can** take and submit photos of the following, if you get the permission of the person in the photo:

- a photo of an adult you know (friend, parent, neighbor) or an adult stranger in a place where they have a reasonable expectation of privacy if they sign a photo release.

Red light: You **cannot** take and submit photos of the following:

- you or anyone else engaging in an illegal activity
- a photo where someone is identifiable and doesn't want their photo used

If you submit a photo of illegal activities, we will delete it upon receipt. However, if it appears that you or someone in the photo is being harmed or threatened, we may have to report the incident to the authorities.

- **Slide #25: Submitting photos and releases through Qualtrics**

Now, we're going to practice getting someone's permission to be photographed for the study by using the photo release form I shared on the screen earlier. We'll move into breakout rooms for this activity.

[Have participants move into breakout rooms.]

[Share screen with the Qualtrics form.] In breakout rooms, an MDRC research team member will walk them through the process of receiving a Qualtrics link, talking through the photo release script process and asking for permission, filling out the photo release form in Qualtrics, and submitting it to the MDRC team online via Qualtrics. Participant-researchers will practice talking through the process, script, form and asking for consent. Answer questions about the process.

Questions for small group/break out rooms:

1. How did that photo release process go? Is filling out the form with someone something you feel comfortable doing?
2. Can you imagine any scenarios where you wouldn't feel comfortable doing it? What will you do then?
3. Do you have any questions about how to walk through the form with someone?

- **Slide #26: Wrap-up**

Now we're going to wrap our meeting. Thank you for your time and attention during today's orientation.

- **Slide #27: Timeline**

After today's call, we'll send you a gift card as a thank you for your time and participation. Be on the lookout for an email with the link from GiftBit. Let us know if you don't get it.

You'll also receive your first prompt via text. Please take your first photo in the next seven days, and upload your caption and photo release (if you need it) to Qualtrics. You'll receive three prompts before we meet again to conduct our first photo analysis session, which will be on XX at XX p.m.

It's ok if you don't remember everything we talked about today. We will email you a copy of this PowerPoint to refer back to. You can also always call us at the Fatherhood TIES hotline (855) 907-6696 or email us at FatherhoodTIES@mdrc.org if you have questions.